## Universität Stuttgart

## Fachbereich Mathematik

# Strongly consistent detection for nonparametric hypotheses

László Györfi, Harro Walk

Preprint 2014/011

Fachbereich Mathematik Fakultät Mathematik und Physik Universität Stuttgart Pfaffenwaldring 57 D-70 569 Stuttgart

E-Mail: preprints@mathematik.uni-stuttgart.de
WWW: http://www.mathematik.uni-stuttgart.de/preprints

ISSN 1613-8309

@ Alle Rechte vorbehalten. Nachdruck nur mit Genehmigung des Autors.  $\mbox{\sc MT}_EX-Style:$  Winfried Geis, Thomas Merkle

László Györfi and Harro Walk

Consider two robust detection problems formulated by nonparametric hypotheses such that both pairs hypotheses are composite and indistinguishable. Strongly consistent testing rules are shown.

#### 1 Composite hypotheses defined by half spaces of distributions

Let  $v_0, v_1$  be fixed distributions on  $\mathbb{R}^d$  which are the nominal distributions under two hypotheses. Let

$$V(\mathbf{v}, \boldsymbol{\mu}) = \sup_{A \subset \mathbb{R}^d} |\mathbf{v}(A) - \boldsymbol{\mu}(A)|$$

denote the total variation distance between two distributions v and  $\mu$ , where the supremum is taken over all Borel sets of  $\mathbb{R}^d$ .

Let  $X, X_1, X_2, ...$  be i.i.d. random vectors according to a common distribution  $\mu$ . We observe  $X_1, ..., X_n$ . Under the hypothesis  $H_j$  (j = 0, 1) the distribution  $\mu$  is a distorted version of  $v_j$ . Formally define the two hypotheses by

$$H_0 = \{ \mu : V(\mu, \nu_0) < V(\mu, \nu_1) \}, \tag{1}$$

and

$$H_1 = \{ \mu : V(\mu, \nu_1) < V(\mu, \nu_0) \}.$$
(2)

László Györfi

Harro Walk

Department of Mathematics, University of Stuttgart, Pfaffenwaldring 57, 70569 Stuttgart, Germany e-mail: walk@mathematik.uni-stuttgart.de.



Department of Computer Science and Information Theory, Budapest University of Technology and Economics, Stoczek u.2, 1521 Budapest, Hungary e-mail: gyorfi@cs.bme.hu. The research reported here was supported in part by the National Development Agency (NFÜ, Hungary) as part of the project Introduction of Cognitive Methods for UAV Collision Avoidance Using Millimeter Wave Radar, (grant no.: KMR-12-1-2012-0008)

Our aim is to construct a distribution-free strong consistent test, which makes error only finitely many times almost surely (a.s.). The concept of strong consistent test is quite unusual, it means that both on  $H_0$  and on  $H_1$  the test makes a.s. no error after a random sample size. In other words, denoting by  $\mathbb{P}_0$  and  $\mathbb{P}_1$  the probability under the hypotheses  $H_0$  and  $H_1$ , we have

$$\mathbb{P}_0$$
{rejecting  $H_0$  for only finitely many  $n$ } = 1

and

 $\mathbb{P}_1$ {rejecting  $H_1$  for only finitely many n} = 1.

In a real life problem, for example, when we get the data sequentially, one gets data just once, and should make good inference for these data. Strong consistency means that the single sequence of inference is a.s. perfect if the sample size is large enough. This concept is close to the definition of discernability introduced by Dembo and Peres [4]. For a discussion and references, we refer the reader to Biau and Györfi [5], Devroye and Lugosi [8], Gretton and Györfi [10] and Györfi and Walk [15].

Motivated by a related goodness of fit test statistic of Györfi and van der Meulen [14], put

$$L_{n,0} = \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu_n(A_{n,j}) - v_0(A_{n,j})|,$$

and

$$L_{n,1} = \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu_n(A_{n,j}) - \mathbf{v}_1(A_{n,j})|,$$

where  $\mu_n$  denotes the empirical measures associated with the sample  $X_1, \ldots, X_n$ , so that

$$\mu_n(A) = \frac{\#\{i : X_i \in A, i = 1, \dots, n\}}{n}$$

for any Borel subset *A*, and  $\mathscr{P}_n = \{A_{n,1}, \dots, A_{n,m_n}\}$  is a finite partition of  $\mathbb{R}^d$ . Introduce the test such that accept the hypothesis  $H_0$  if

$$L_{n,0} < L_{n,1},\tag{3}$$

and reject otherwise.

The sequence of partitions  $\mathscr{P}_1, \mathscr{P}_2, \ldots$  is called asymptotically fine if for any sphere *S* centered at the origin

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} \max_{A \in \mathscr{P}_{n,A} \cap S \neq \emptyset} diam(A) = 0.$$
(4)

**Theorem 1.** Assume that the sequence of partitions  $\mathcal{P}_1, \mathcal{P}_2, \ldots$  is asymptotically fine and

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} \frac{m_n}{n} = 0. \tag{5}$$

Then the test (3) is strongly consistent.

*Proof.* Assume  $H_0$  without loss of generality. Then the error event means that

$$L_{n,0} \geq L_{n,1}$$
.

Thus,

$$0 \leq \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu_n(A_{n,j}) - \mathbf{v}_0(A_{n,j})| - \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu_n(A_{n,j}) - \mathbf{v}_1(A_{n,j})|$$
  
$$\leq 2L_n + \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu(A_{n,j}) - \mathbf{v}_0(A_{n,j})| - \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu(A_{n,j}) - \mathbf{v}_1(A_{n,j})|,$$

where

$$L_n = \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu_n(A_{n,j}) - \mu(A_{n,j})|$$

Introduce the notation

$$\varepsilon = -(V(\mu, v_0) - V(\mu, v_1)) > 0.$$

The sequence of partitions  $\mathscr{P}_1, \mathscr{P}_2, \ldots$  is asymptotically fine, which implies that

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} \left( \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu(A_{n,j}) - \nu_0(A_{n,j})| - \sum_{j=1}^{m_n} |\mu(A_{n,j}) - \nu_1(A_{n,j})| \right)$$
  
= 2 (V(\mu, \nu\_0) - V(\mu, \nu\_1))  
= -2\varepsilon,

(cf. Biau and Györfi [5]). Thus, for all *n* large enough,

$$P_{e,n} = \mathbb{P}\{\text{error}\} \le \mathbb{P}\{0 \le 2L_n - \varepsilon\}.$$

Beirlant, Devroye, Györfi and Vajda [2] and Biau and Györfi [5] proved that, for any  $\delta > 0$ ,

$$\mathbb{P}\{L_n > \delta\} \le 2^{m_n} e^{-n\delta^2/2}.$$

Therefore

$$P_{e,n} \leq 2^{m_n} e^{-n\varepsilon^2/8}.$$

Because of (5),

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} P_{e,n} < \infty,$$

and so the Borel-Cantelli lemma implies that a.s.

$$L_{n,0}-L_{n,1}<0$$

for all *n* large enough, i.e., the error

László Györfi and Harro Walk

$$L_{n,0}-L_{n,1}\geq 0$$

occurs a.s. for only finitely many n. Thus, the strong consistency is proved.  $\Box$ 

In a straightforward way, the proof of Theorem 1 can be extended to infinite partitions if we assume that for each sphere S centered at the origin

$$\lim_{n\to\infty}\frac{|\{j:A_{n,j}\cap S\neq\emptyset\}|}{n}=0.$$

Next, a variant of the test (3) with much smaller computational complexity will be defined. The test statistic is based on recursive histogram. In this section assume that the partitions are infinite and all cells of the partitions have finite and positive Lebesgue measure  $\lambda$ . Let  $A_n(x)$  denote the cell of  $\mathcal{P}_n$  into which x belongs. The density estimate

$$f_n(x) := \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\{X_i \in A_i(x)\}}}{\lambda(A_i(x))}$$

is called recursive histogram.

For  $A \in \mathscr{P}_n$ , introduce the estimate

$$\mu_n^*(A) := \int_A f_n(x) dx.$$

Notice that  $\mu_n^*(A)$  can be calculated in a recursive way, which is important in on-line applications. These definitions imply that

$$\mu_n^*(A) = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \int_A \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\{X_i \in A_i(x)\}}}{\lambda(A_i(x))} dx = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \int_A \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\{x \in A_i(X_i)\}}}{\lambda(A_i(X_i))} dx = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{\lambda(A \cap A_i(X_i))}{\lambda(A_i(X_i))}$$

If the sequence of partitions  $\mathscr{P}_1, \mathscr{P}_2, \ldots$  is nested, i.e., the sequence of  $\sigma$ -algebras  $\sigma(\mathscr{P}_n)$  is non-decreasing, then for  $A \in \mathscr{P}_n$  let the ancestor  $B_A^{(i)} \in \mathscr{P}_i$  be such that  $A \subset B_A^{(i)}$   $(i \leq n)$ . One can check that for nested partitions the estimate has the following form:

$$\mu_n^*(A) = rac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \mathbb{I}_{\{X_i \in \mathcal{B}_A^{(i)}\}} rac{\lambda(A)}{\lambda(\mathcal{B}_A^{(i)})}.$$

Put

$$L_{n,j}^* := \sum_{A \in \mathscr{P}_n} |\mu_n^*(A) - \nu_j(A)|$$

(j = 0, 1). Introduce the test such that accept the hypothesis  $H_0$  if

$$L_{n,0}^* < L_{n,1}^*, \tag{6}$$

and reject otherwise.

**Theorem 2.** Assume that the sequence of partitions  $\mathscr{P}_1, \mathscr{P}_2, \ldots$  is asymptotically fine such that

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{n^2 \inf_j \lambda(A_{n,j})} < \infty.$$
(7)

Further suppose that  $\mu$  has a density. Then the test (6) is strongly consistent.

*Proof.* Assume  $H_0$  without loss of generality. One notices

$$L_{n,0}^* - L_{n,1}^* \le 2L_n^* + Q_n^*$$

where

$$L_n^* = \sum_{A \in \mathscr{P}_n} |\mu_n^*(A) - \mu(A)|,$$

and

$$\mathcal{Q}_n^* = \sum_{A \in \mathscr{P}_n} |\mu(A) - \nu_0(A)| - \sum_{A \in \mathscr{P}_n} |\mu(A) - \nu_1(A)|.$$

By Biau and Györfi [5],

$$Q_n^* \to 2(V(\mu, v_0) - V(\mu, v_1)) < 0,$$

the latter because of  $H_0$ . Next  $L_n^* \to 0$  a.s. will be shown. Denote the density of  $\mu$  by f. Thus

$$L_n^* = \sum_{A \in \mathscr{P}_n} \left| \int_A f_n(x) dx - \int_A f(x) dx \right| \le \int |f_n(x) - f(x)| dx.$$

Therefore we have to prove the strong  $L_1$ -consistency of the recursive histogram. Consider the bias part. Introduce the ordinary histogram:

$$\tilde{f}_n(x) := \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\{X_i \in A_n(x)\}}}{\lambda(A_n(x))},$$

and put

$$\bar{f}_n(x) := \mathbb{E}\{\tilde{f}_n(x)\} = \frac{\mu(A_n(x))}{\lambda(A_n(x))}.$$

According to the Abou-Jaoude theorem, if the sequence of partitions  $\mathscr{P}_1, \mathscr{P}_2, \ldots$  is asymptotically fine, then

$$\int |\bar{f}_n - f| \to 0$$

(cf. Devroye and Györfi [6]). Thus, for the bias term of the recursive histogram, we get

$$\int |\mathbb{E}\{f_n\} - f| = \int \left|\frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^n \bar{f}_i - f\right| \le \frac{1}{n}\sum_{i=1}^n \int |\bar{f}_i - f| \to 0.$$
(8)

For the variation term of the recursive histogram, we apply the generalized theorem of Kolmogorov: Let  $U_n$ , n = 1, 2, ... be an  $L_2$ -valued sequence of independent, zero mean random variables such that

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\mathbb{E}\{\|U_n\|_2^2\}}{n^2} < \infty$$

where  $\|\cdot\|_2$  denotes the  $L_2$  norm. Then

$$\lim_{n \to \infty} \left\| \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n U_i \right\|_2 = 0$$

a.s. (cf. Györfi et al. [11]). For

$$U_n := \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\{X_n \in A_n(\cdot)\}}}{\lambda(A_n(\cdot))} - \mathbb{E}\left\{\frac{\mathbb{I}_{\{X_n \in A_n(\cdot)\}}}{\lambda(A_n(\cdot))}\right\},$$

one has to verify the condition of the generalized Kolmogorov theorem:

$$\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\mathbb{E}\left\{ \left\| \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\left\{X_{n} \in A_{n}(\cdot)\right\}}}{\lambda(A_{n}(\cdot))} - \mathbb{E}\left\{\frac{\mathbb{I}_{\left\{X_{n} \in A_{n}(\cdot)\right\}}}{\lambda(A_{n}(\cdot))}\right\}\right\|_{2}^{2}\right\}}{n^{2}}{} \leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\mathbb{E}\left\{ \left\| \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\left\{X_{n} \in A_{n}(\cdot)\right\}}}{\lambda(A_{n}(\cdot))}\right\|_{2}^{2}\right\}}{n^{2}}{}$$
$$= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\mathbb{E}\left\{\int \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\left\{X_{n} \in A_{n}(x)\right\}}}{\lambda(A_{n}(x))^{2}}dx\right\}}{n^{2}}{}$$
$$= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\mathbb{E}\left\{\int \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\left\{X_{n} \in A_{n}(x)\right\}}}{\lambda(A_{n}(x))^{2}}dx\right\}}{n^{2}}{}$$
$$= \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\mathbb{E}\left\{\int \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\left\{X_{n} \in A_{n}(x)\right\}}}{\lambda(A_{n}(x))^{2}}dx\right\}}{}{}$$
$$\leq \sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{\mathbb{E}\left\{\int \frac{\mathbb{I}_{\left\{X_{n} \in A_{n}(x)\right\}}}{\lambda(A_{n}(x))}\right\}}{}$$

by the condition of the theorem, and so

$$\int |f_n - \mathbb{E}\{f_n\}|^2 \to 0.$$
(9)

a.s. From Lemma 3.1 in Györfi and Masry [13] we get that the limit relations (8) and (9) imply

$$\int |f_n - f| \to 0$$

a.s. Therefore a.s.

$$L_{n,0}^* - L_{n,1}^* < 0$$

for all *n* large enough, and so the the strong consistency is proved.  $\Box$ 

#### 2 Composite hypotheses defined by half spheres of distributions

Again, under the hypothesis  $H'_j$  (j = 0, 1) the distribution  $\mu$  is a distorted version of  $v_j$ . In this section we assume that the true distribution lies within a certain total variation distance of the underlying nominal distribution.

We formally define the two hypotheses by

$$H'_{j} = \left\{ \mu : V(\mu, \nu_{j}) < \Delta \right\}, \quad j = 0, 1 , \qquad (10)$$

where

$$\Delta := (1/2)V(v_0, v_1).$$

Because of

$$H'_i \subset H_j, \quad j=0,1,$$

the test (3) in the previous section is strongly consistent. In this section we introduce a simpler test. For the notations

$$f = \frac{dv}{d(v+\mu)}$$
 and  $g = \frac{d\mu}{d(v+\mu)}$ ,

the general version of Scheffé's theorem implies that

$$V(\boldsymbol{\nu},\boldsymbol{\mu}) = \boldsymbol{\nu}(A^*) - \boldsymbol{\mu}(A^*),$$

where

$$A^* = \{x : f(x) > g(x)\}.$$

Introduce the notation

$$A_{0,1} = \{x : f_0(x) > f_1(x)\} = \{x : f_0(x) > 1/2\} ,$$

where

$$f_0 = \frac{dv_0}{d(v_0 + v_1)}$$
 and  $f_1 = \frac{dv_1}{d(v_0 + v_1)}$ 

The proposed test is the following: accept hypothesis  $H'_0$  if

$$\mu_n(A_{0,1}) \ge \frac{\nu_0(A_{0,1}) + \nu_1(A_{0,1})}{2},\tag{11}$$

and reject otherwise.

Then, we get that

**Theorem 3.** The test (11) is strongly consistent.

*Proof.* Assume  $H_0$  without loss of generality. Put

László Györfi and Harro Walk

$$\varepsilon = \Delta - V(\mu, v_0) > 0.$$

Observe that by the Scheffé theorem [22],

$$\begin{aligned} v_0(A_{0,1}) - \mu(A_{0,1}) &\leq V(v_0, \mu) \\ &= \Delta - \varepsilon \\ &= \frac{1}{2}V(v_0, v_1) - \varepsilon \\ &= \frac{1}{2}(v_0(A_{0,1}) - v_1(A_{0,1})) - \varepsilon. \end{aligned}$$

Rearranging the obtained inequality, we get that

$$\mu(A_{0,1}) \ge \frac{\nu_0(A_{0,1}) + \nu_1(A_{0,1})}{2} + \varepsilon .$$
(12)

Therefore, (12) and Hoeffding's inequality [16] imply that

$$\mathbb{P}\{\text{error}\} = \mathbb{P}\left\{\mu_n(A_{0,1}) < \frac{\nu_0(A_{0,1}) + \nu_1(A_{0,1})}{2}\right\}$$
  
$$\leq \mathbb{P}\left\{\mu(A_{0,1}) - \mu_n(A_{0,1}) > \varepsilon\right\}$$
  
$$\leq e^{-2n\varepsilon^2}.$$

Therefore the Borel-Cantelli lemma implies the strong consistency.

#### **3** Discussion

INDISTINGUISHABILITY.

For the hypotheses  $H_0$  and  $H_1$  there is no positive margin, because the gap between  $H_0$  and  $H_1$  is just the hyperplane

$$\{\mu: V(\mu, v_0) = V(\mu, v_1)\}.$$

Moreover, the margin is zero:

$$\inf_{\mu\in H_0,\nu\in H_1}V(\mu,\nu)=0.$$

Without any positive margin condition it is impossible the derive uniform bound on the error probabilities. The pair  $(H_0, H_1)$  of hypotheses is called distinguishable if there is a sequence of uniformly consistent tests, which means that the errors of the first and second kind tend to zero uniformly. For a test  $T_n$  with sample size n, let  $\alpha_{n,\mu}(T_n)$  and  $\beta_{n,\mu}(T_n)$  denote the errors of the first and second kind, resp. Put

$$\alpha_n(T_n,H_0) = \sup_{\mu \in H_0} \alpha_{n,\mu}(T_n) \qquad \beta_n(T_n,H_1) = \sup_{\mu \in H_1} \beta_{n,\mu}(T_n).$$

A sequence of tests  $T_n$ , n = 1, 2, ... is called uniformly consistent if

$$\lim_{n\to\infty}(\alpha_n(T_n,H_0)+\beta_n(T_n,H_1))=0.$$

It is known that a necessary condition of the distinguishable property is that for any distribution  $\mu$ 

$$\max\left\{\inf_{\boldsymbol{\nu}\in H_0}V(\boldsymbol{\mu},\boldsymbol{\nu}),\inf_{\boldsymbol{\nu}\in H_1}V(\boldsymbol{\mu},\boldsymbol{\nu})\right\}>0.$$

(See Barron [1], Ermakov [9], Hoeffding and Wolfowitz [17], Kraft [18], LeCam [19], LeCam and Schwartz [20], Schwartz [23].) Obviously, this necessary condition is not satisfied when  $\mu^* = (\nu_1 + \nu_2)/2$ . Because of

$$\max\left\{\inf_{\boldsymbol{\nu}\in H_0'}V(\boldsymbol{\mu}^*,\boldsymbol{\nu}),\inf_{\boldsymbol{\nu}\in H_1'}V(\boldsymbol{\mu}^*,\boldsymbol{\nu})\right\}=0,$$

the pair  $(H'_0, H'_1)$  of hypotheses is indistinguishable, too.

#### COMPUTATION.

The hypothesis testing method (11) proposed above is computationally quite simple. The set  $A_{0,1}$  and the nominal probabilities  $v_0(A_{0,1})$  and  $v_1(A_{0,1})$  may be computed and stored before seeing the data. Then one merely needs to calculate  $\mu_n(A_{0,1})$ .

HYPOTHESES FORMULATED BY DENSITIES.

Devroye, Györfi, Lugosi [7] formulated a special case of hypotheses  $(H'_0, H'_1)$ , when  $\mu$ ,  $v_0$  and  $v_1$  have densities f,  $f_0$  and  $f_1$ . Under some mild margin condition they proved uniform exponential bounds for the probability of failure for  $k \ge 2$  hypotheses. Moreover, they illustrated the robustness for additive noise scheme, and showed examples, where the test (11) is consistent and the maximum likelihood test does not work. Formally, the maximum likelihood test  $T_n$  is defined by

$$T_n = \begin{cases} 0 & \text{if } \sum_{i=1}^n (\log f_0(X_i) - \log f_1(X_i)) > 0\\ 1 & \text{otherwise.} \end{cases}$$

For  $f \in H'_0$ , the strong law of large numbers implies the strong consistency of the maximum likelihood test if both integrals  $\int f \log f_0$  and  $\int f \log f_1$  are well defined, and

$$\int f \log f_0 > \int f \log f_1.$$

ROBUSTNESS.

Note that Theorem 3 does not require any assumption for the nominal distributions. The test is robust in a very strong sense: we obtain consistency under the sole assumption that the distorted distribution remains within a certain total variation distance of the nominal distribution. For example, if  $\mu$  is either  $(1 - \delta)v_0 + \delta\tau$ , or  $(1-\delta)v_1 + \delta\tau$  with arbitrary "strange" distribution  $\tau$  such that  $\delta < \Delta$ , then we have (10):

$$V(\mu, v_0) = V((1 - \delta)v_0 + \delta\tau, v_0)$$
  
=  $V(\delta\tau, \delta v_0)$   
 $\leq \delta$   
 $< \Delta$ .

 $\tau$  can be the outliers' distribution, it is really arbitrary, for example, not having expectations, or can be even a discrete distribution. The probability of outlier  $\delta$  can be at most equal to  $\Delta$ . The outliers can be formulated such that we are given three, independent i.i.d. sequences  $\{U_i\}, \{V_i\}, \{I_i\}$ , where  $\{U_i\}, \{V_i\}$  are  $\mathbb{R}^d$ -valued, and  $\{I_i\}$  are binary. Put

$$X_n = (1 - I_n)U_n + I_n V_n.$$

If  $U_n$  is  $v_0$  distributed,  $V_n$  is  $\tau$  distributed,  $\mathbb{P}\{I_n = 1\} = \delta$ , then we get the previous scheme. Other application can be the case of censored observations, when  $V_n$  is a distortion of  $U_n$  such that some components of the vector  $U_n$  are censored. In this scheme  $\delta$  is the probability of censoring. Notice that in order to estimate the distribution from censored observations one needs samples  $\{(X_i, I_i)\}_{i=1}^n$  (cf. Györfi et al. [12]), while for detection it is enough to have  $\{X_i\}_{i=1}^n$ .

OPEN PROBLEMS.

1. Characterize the distributions  $\mu \in H_0 \setminus H'_0$ , where the simple test (11) is strongly consistent. As in the proof of Theorem 3 the strong consistency can be verified if

$$\mu(A_{0,1}) > \frac{\nu_0(A_{0,1}) + \nu_1(A_{0,1})}{2}.$$

We are interested in non-consistent examples, too.

2. Maybe one can improve the test (3), since in the construction of the partitions we don't take into account the properties of  $v_0$  and  $v_1$ . For example, we can include somehow the set  $A_{0,1}$ .

#### SEQUENTIAL TESTS.

We dealt with sequences of nonparametric tests with increasing sample size n, where almost surely type I and II errors occur only for finitely many n. One has to distinguish them from nonparametric sequential tests with power one (cf. Darling and Robbins [3], Section 6 in Robbins [21], Section 9.2 in Sen [24]). Such tests almost surely terminate at a random sample size with rejection of a null hypothesis  $H_0$  after finitely many observations, if the alternative hypothesis is valid, and with positive probability do not terminate if  $H_0$  is valid (open-ended procedures). In the latter case an upper bound of the complementary probabilities is an upper bound for the type I error probability.

#### References

- 1. Barron A.R.: Uniformly powerful goodness of fit tests. *Annals of Statistics*, **17**, 107–124 (1989)
- 2. Beirlant, J., Devroye, L., Györfi, L. and Vajda, I.: Large deviations of divergence measures on partitions, *J. Statistical Planning and Inference*, **93**, 1–16 (2001)
- Darling, D. A. and Robbins, H.: Some nonparametric sequential tests with power one, *Proc. National Academy of Sciences U.S.A.*, 61, 804–809 (1968)
- Dembo, A. and Peres, Y.: A topological criterion for hypothesis testing, *Annals of Statistics*, 22, 106–117 (1994)
- Biau, G. and Györfi, L.: On the asymptotic properties of a nonparametric l<sub>1</sub>-test statistic of homogeneity. *IEEE Transactions on Information Theory*, **51**, 3965–3973 (2005)
- Devroye, L. and Györfi, L.: Nonparametric Density Estimation: the L<sub>1</sub> View. Wiley, New York (1985)
- Devroye, L., Györfi, L. and Lugosi, G.: A note on robust hypothesis testing, *IEEE Trans. Information Theory*, 48, 2111–2114 (2002)
- Devroye, L. and Lugosi, G.: Almost sure classification of densities, J. Nonparametric Statistics, 14, 675–698 (2002)
- 9. Ermakov, M.: On distinguishability of hypotheses. http://arxiv.org/pdf/1308.4295.pdf, (2013)
- Gretton, A. and Györfi, L.: Consistent nonparametric tests of independence, *Journal of Ma*chine Learning Research, 11, 1391–1423 (2010)
- Györfi, L., Györfi, Z. and Vajda, I.: A strong law of large numbers and some applications. Studia Scientiarum Mathematicarum Hungarica, 12, 233–244 (1977)
- 12. Györfi, L., Kohler, M., Krzyżak, A. and Walk, H.: A Distribution-Free Theory of Nonparametric Regression. Springer, New York (2002)
- 13. Györfi, L. and Masry, E.: The  $L_1$  and  $L_2$  strong consistency of recursive kernel density estimation from dependent samples. *IEEE Trans. Information Theory*, **36**, 531–539 (1990)
- Györfi, L. and van der Meulen, E. C.: A consistent goodness of fit test based on the total variation distance, in *Nonparametric Functional Estimation and Related Topics*, (G. Roussas, Ed.), Kluwer, Dordrecht, pp. 631–645 (1990)
- Györfi, L. and Walk, H.: Strongly consistent nonparametric tests of conditional independence, Statistics and Probability Letters, 82, 1145–1150 (2012)
- 16. Hoeffding, W. Probability inequalities for sums of bounded random variables. *Journal of the American Statistical Association*, **58**, 13–30 (1963)
- Hoeffding, W. and Wolfowitz, J.: Distinguishability of sets of distributions. *The Annals of Mathematical Statistics*, 29, 700–718 (1958)
- Kraft, C.: Some conditions for consistency and uniform consistency. University of California Publications in Statistics, 2, 125–142 (1955)
- Le Cam, L.: Convergence of estimates under dimensionality restrictions. *Annals of Statistics*, 1, 38–53 (1973).
- Le Cam, L. and Schwartz, L.: A necessary and sufficient condition for the existence of consistent estimates. *Annals of Mathematical Statistics*, 31, 40–150 (1960)
- Robbins, H.: Statistical methods related to the law of the iterated logarithm. *The Annals of Mathematical Statistics*, 41, 1397–1409 (1970)
- 22. Scheffé, H.: A useful convergence theorem for probability distributions. *The Annals of Mathematical Statistics*, **18**, 434–438 (1947)
- 23. Schwartz, L.: On Bayes procedures. Zeitschrift für Wahrscheinlichkeitstheorie und verwandte Gebiete, **4**, 10–26 (1965)
- 24. Sen, P. K.: Sequential Nonparametrics: Invariance Principles and Statistical Inference. Wiley, New York (1981)

László Györfi Department of Computer Science and Information Theory Budapest University of Technology and Economics Stoczek u.2 1521 Budapest Hungary **E-Mail:** gyorfi@cs.bme.hu

Harro Walk Universität Stuttgart Fachbereich Mathematik Pfaffenwaldring 57 70569 Stuttgart Germany **E-Mail:** walk@mathematik.uni-stuttgart.de

#### Erschienene Preprints ab Nummer 2007/2007-001

Komplette Liste: http://www.mathematik.uni-stuttgart.de/preprints

- 2014-014 Kohler, M.; Krzyżak, A.; Walk, H.: Nonparametric recursive quantile estimation
- 2014-013 Kohler, M.; Krzyżak, A.; Tent, R.; Walk, H.: Nonparametric quantile estimation using importance sampling
- 2014-012 *Györfi, L.; Ottucsák, G.; Walk, H.:* The growth optimal investment strategy is secure, too.
- 2014-011 Györfi, L.; Walk, H.: Strongly consistent detection for nonparametric hypotheses
- 2014-010 *Köster, I.:* Finite Groups with Sylow numbers  $\{q^x, a, b\}$
- 2014-009 Kahnert, D.: Hausdorff Dimension of Rings
- 2014-008 Steinwart, I.: Measuring the Capacity of Sets of Functions in the Analysis of ERM
- 2014-007 *Steinwart, I.:* Convergence Types and Rates in Generic Karhunen-Loève Expansions with Applications to Sample Path Properties
- 2014-006 Steinwart, I.; Pasin, C.; Williamson, R.; Zhang, S.: Elicitation and Identification of Properties
- 2014-005 *Schmid, J.; Griesemer, M.:* Integration of Non-Autonomous Linear Evolution Equations
- 2014-004 *Markhasin, L.:*  $L_2$  and  $S_{p,q}^r B$ -discrepancy of (order 2) digital nets
- 2014-003 *Markhasin, L.:* Discrepancy and integration in function spaces with dominating mixed smoothness
- 2014-002 Eberts, M.; Steinwart, I.: Optimal Learning Rates for Localized SVMs
- 2014-001 *Giesselmann, J.:* A relative entropy approach to convergence of a low order approximation to a nonlinear elasticity model with viscosity and capillarity
- 2013-016 Steinwart, I.: Fully Adaptive Density-Based Clustering
- 2013-015 *Steinwart, I.:* Some Remarks on the Statistical Analysis of SVMs and Related Methods
- 2013-014 *Rohde, C.; Zeiler, C.:* A Relaxation Riemann Solver for Compressible Two-Phase Flow with Phase Transition and Surface Tension
- 2013-013 Moroianu, A.; Semmelmann, U.: Generalized Killing spinors on Einstein manifolds
- 2013-012 Moroianu, A.; Semmelmann, U.: Generalized Killing Spinors on Spheres
- 2013-011 Kohls, K; Rösch, A.; Siebert, K.G.: Convergence of Adaptive Finite Elements for Control Constrained Optimal Control Problems
- 2013-010 *Corli, A.; Rohde, C.; Schleper, V.:* Parabolic Approximations of Diffusive-Dispersive Equations
- 2013-009 Nava-Yazdani, E.; Polthier, K.: De Casteljau's Algorithm on Manifolds
- 2013-008 *Bächle, A.; Margolis, L.:* Rational conjugacy of torsion units in integral group rings of non-solvable groups
- 2013-007 Knarr, N.; Stroppel, M.J.: Heisenberg groups over composition algebras
- 2013-006 Knarr, N.; Stroppel, M.J.: Heisenberg groups, semifields, and translation planes
- 2013-005 *Eck, C.; Kutter, M.; Sändig, A.-M.; Rohde, C.:* A Two Scale Model for Liquid Phase Epitaxy with Elasticity: An Iterative Procedure
- 2013-004 Griesemer, M.; Wellig, D.: The Strong-Coupling Polaron in Electromagnetic Fields
- 2013-003 *Kabil, B.; Rohde, C.:* The Influence of Surface Tension and Configurational Forces on the Stability of Liquid-Vapor Interfaces

- 2013-002 *Devroye, L.; Ferrario, P.G.; Györfi, L.; Walk, H.:* Strong universal consistent estimate of the minimum mean squared error
- 2013-001 *Kohls, K.; Rösch, A.; Siebert, K.G.:* A Posteriori Error Analysis of Optimal Control Problems with Control Constraints
- 2012-018 *Kimmerle, W.; Konovalov, A.:* On the Prime Graph of the Unit Group of Integral Group Rings of Finite Groups II
- 2012-017 *Stroppel, B.; Stroppel, M.:* Desargues, Doily, Dualities, and Exceptional Isomorphisms
- 2012-016 *Moroianu, A.; Pilca, M.; Semmelmann, U.:* Homogeneous almost quaternion-Hermitian manifolds
- 2012-015 *Steinke, G.F.; Stroppel, M.J.:* Simple groups acting two-transitively on the set of generators of a finite elation Laguerre plane
- 2012-014 *Steinke, G.F.; Stroppel, M.J.:* Finite elation Laguerre planes admitting a two-transitive group on their set of generators
- 2012-013 *Diaz Ramos, J.C.; Dominguez Vázquez, M.; Kollross, A.:* Polar actions on complex hyperbolic spaces
- 2012-012 Moroianu; A.; Semmelmann, U.: Weakly complex homogeneous spaces
- 2012-011 Moroianu; A.; Semmelmann, U.: Invariant four-forms and symmetric pairs
- 2012-010 Hamilton, M.J.D.: The closure of the symplectic cone of elliptic surfaces
- 2012-009 Hamilton, M.J.D.: Iterated fibre sums of algebraic Lefschetz fibrations
- 2012-008 Hamilton, M.J.D.: The minimal genus problem for elliptic surfaces
- 2012-007 *Ferrario, P.:* Partitioning estimation of local variance based on nearest neighbors under censoring
- 2012-006 Stroppel, M.: Buttons, Holes and Loops of String: Lacing the Doily
- 2012-005 Hantsch, F.: Existence of Minimizers in Restricted Hartree-Fock Theory
- 2012-004 Grundhöfer, T.; Stroppel, M.; Van Maldeghem, H.: Unitals admitting all translations
- 2012-003 Hamilton, M.J.D.: Representing homology classes by symplectic surfaces
- 2012-002 Hamilton, M.J.D.: On certain exotic 4-manifolds of Akhmedov and Park
- 2012-001 Jentsch, T.: Parallel submanifolds of the real 2-Grassmannian
- 2011-028 Spreer, J.: Combinatorial 3-manifolds with cyclic automorphism group
- 2011-027 *Griesemer, M.; Hantsch, F.; Wellig, D.:* On the Magnetic Pekar Functional and the Existence of Bipolarons
- 2011-026 Müller, S.: Bootstrapping for Bandwidth Selection in Functional Data Regression
- 2011-025 *Felber, T.; Jones, D.; Kohler, M.; Walk, H.:* Weakly universally consistent static forecasting of stationary and ergodic time series via local averaging and least squares estimates
- 2011-024 Jones, D.; Kohler, M.; Walk, H.: Weakly universally consistent forecasting of stationary and ergodic time series
- 2011-023 *Györfi, L.; Walk, H.:* Strongly consistent nonparametric tests of conditional independence
- 2011-022 *Ferrario, P.G.; Walk, H.:* Nonparametric partitioning estimation of residual and local variance based on first and second nearest neighbors
- 2011-021 Eberts, M.; Steinwart, I.: Optimal regression rates for SVMs using Gaussian kernels
- 2011-020 Frank, R.L.; Geisinger, L.: Refined Semiclassical Asymptotics for Fractional Powers of the Laplace Operator

- 2011-019 *Frank, R.L.; Geisinger, L.:* Two-term spectral asymptotics for the Dirichlet Laplacian on a bounded domain
- 2011-018 Hänel, A.; Schulz, C.; Wirth, J.: Embedded eigenvalues for the elastic strip with cracks
- 2011-017 Wirth, J.: Thermo-elasticity for anisotropic media in higher dimensions
- 2011-016 Höllig, K.; Hörner, J.: Programming Multigrid Methods with B-Splines
- 2011-015 *Ferrario, P.:* Nonparametric Local Averaging Estimation of the Local Variance Function
- 2011-014 *Müller, S.; Dippon, J.:* k-NN Kernel Estimate for Nonparametric Functional Regression in Time Series Analysis
- 2011-013 Knarr, N.; Stroppel, M.: Unitals over composition algebras
- 2011-012 *Knarr, N.; Stroppel, M.:* Baer involutions and polarities in Moufang planes of characteristic two
- 2011-011 Knarr, N.; Stroppel, M.: Polarities and planar collineations of Moufang planes
- 2011-010 Jentsch, T.; Moroianu, A.; Semmelmann, U.: Extrinsic hyperspheres in manifolds with special holonomy
- 2011-009 *Wirth, J.:* Asymptotic Behaviour of Solutions to Hyperbolic Partial Differential Equations
- 2011-008 Stroppel, M.: Orthogonal polar spaces and unitals
- 2011-007 *Nagl, M.:* Charakterisierung der Symmetrischen Gruppen durch ihre komplexe Gruppenalgebra
- 2011-006 *Solanes, G.; Teufel, E.:* Horo-tightness and total (absolute) curvatures in hyperbolic spaces
- 2011-005 Ginoux, N.; Semmelmann, U.: Imaginary Kählerian Killing spinors I
- 2011-004 *Scherer, C.W.; Köse, I.E.:* Control Synthesis using Dynamic *D*-Scales: Part II Gain-Scheduled Control
- 2011-003 *Scherer, C.W.; Köse, I.E.:* Control Synthesis using Dynamic *D*-Scales: Part I Robust Control
- 2011-002 Alexandrov, B.; Semmelmann, U.: Deformations of nearly parallel G2-structures
- 2011-001 Geisinger, L.; Weidl, T.: Sharp spectral estimates in domains of infinite volume
- 2010-018 Kimmerle, W.; Konovalov, A.: On integral-like units of modular group rings
- 2010-017 Gauduchon, P.; Moroianu, A.; Semmelmann, U.: Almost complex structures on quaternion-Kähler manifolds and inner symmetric spaces
- 2010-016 Moroianu, A.; Semmelmann, U.: Clifford structures on Riemannian manifolds
- 2010-015 Grafarend, E.W.; Kühnel, W.: A minimal atlas for the rotation group SO(3)
- 2010-014 Weidl, T.: Semiclassical Spectral Bounds and Beyond
- 2010-013 Stroppel, M.: Early explicit examples of non-desarguesian plane geometries
- 2010-012 Effenberger, F.: Stacked polytopes and tight triangulations of manifolds
- 2010-011 *Györfi, L.; Walk, H.:* Empirical portfolio selection strategies with proportional transaction costs
- 2010-010 Kohler, M.; Krzyżak, A.; Walk, H.: Estimation of the essential supremum of a regression function
- 2010-009 *Geisinger, L.; Laptev, A.; Weidl, T.:* Geometrical Versions of improved Berezin-Li-Yau Inequalities

- 2010-008 Poppitz, S.; Stroppel, M.: Polarities of Schellhammer Planes
- 2010-007 *Grundhöfer, T.; Krinn, B.; Stroppel, M.:* Non-existence of isomorphisms between certain unitals
- 2010-006 *Höllig, K.; Hörner, J.; Hoffacker, A.:* Finite Element Analysis with B-Splines: Weighted and Isogeometric Methods
- 2010-005 *Kaltenbacher, B.; Walk, H.:* On convergence of local averaging regression function estimates for the regularization of inverse problems
- 2010-004 Kühnel, W.; Solanes, G.: Tight surfaces with boundary
- 2010-003 *Kohler, M; Walk, H.:* On optimal exercising of American options in discrete time for stationary and ergodic data
- 2010-002 *Gulde, M.; Stroppel, M.:* Stabilizers of Subspaces under Similitudes of the Klein Quadric, and Automorphisms of Heisenberg Algebras
- 2010-001 *Leitner, F.:* Examples of almost Einstein structures on products and in cohomogeneity one
- 2009-008 Griesemer, M.; Zenk, H.: On the atomic photoeffect in non-relativistic QED
- 2009-007 *Griesemer, M.; Moeller, J.S.:* Bounds on the minimal energy of translation invariant n-polaron systems
- 2009-006 *Demirel, S.; Harrell II, E.M.:* On semiclassical and universal inequalities for eigenvalues of quantum graphs
- 2009-005 Bächle, A, Kimmerle, W.: Torsion subgroups in integral group rings of finite groups
- 2009-004 Geisinger, L.; Weidl, T.: Universal bounds for traces of the Dirichlet Laplace operator
- 2009-003 Walk, H.: Strong laws of large numbers and nonparametric estimation
- 2009-002 Leitner, F.: The collapsing sphere product of Poincaré-Einstein spaces
- 2009-001 *Brehm, U.; Kühnel, W.:* Lattice triangulations of  $E^3$  and of the 3-torus
- 2008-006 *Kohler, M.; Krzyżak, A.; Walk, H.:* Upper bounds for Bermudan options on Markovian data using nonparametric regression and a reduced number of nested Monte Carlo steps
- 2008-005 *Kaltenbacher, B.; Schöpfer, F.; Schuster, T.:* Iterative methods for nonlinear ill-posed problems in Banach spaces: convergence and applications to parameter identification problems
- 2008-004 *Leitner, F.:* Conformally closed Poincaré-Einstein metrics with intersecting scale singularities
- 2008-003 Effenberger, F.; Kühnel, W.: Hamiltonian submanifolds of regular polytope
- 2008-002 *Hertweck, M.; Höfert, C.R.; Kimmerle, W.:* Finite groups of units and their composition factors in the integral group rings of the groups PSL(2, q)
- 2008-001 *Kovarik, H.; Vugalter, S.; Weidl, T.:* Two dimensional Berezin-Li-Yau inequalities with a correction term
- 2007-006 Weidl, T.: Improved Berezin-Li-Yau inequalities with a remainder term
- 2007-005 Frank, R.L.; Loss, M.; Weidl, T.: Polya's conjecture in the presence of a constant magnetic field
- 2007-004 *Ekholm, T.; Frank, R.L.; Kovarik, H.:* Eigenvalue estimates for Schrödinger operators on metric trees
- 2007-003 Lesky, P.H.; Racke, R.: Elastic and electro-magnetic waves in infinite waveguides
- 2007-002 Teufel, E.: Spherical transforms and Radon transforms in Moebius geometry
- 2007-001 *Meister, A.:* Deconvolution from Fourier-oscillating error densities under decay and smoothness restrictions